#### **Temperature Synthesis Report**









Synthesizing 87 years of scientific inquiry into Trinity River water temperatures



J. Eli Asarian Riverbend Sciences

Kyle De Juilio and David Gaeuman Yurok Tribe Fisheries Program, Trinity River Division

> Seth Naman NOAA Fisheries

Todd Buxton U.S. Bureau of Reclamation





#### Trinity River Science Symposium

December 2, 2021

Seth Naman







#### **Report Status**

- Report in peer review
- Expected to be finalized following peer review in coming months





#### **Report Status**

# Provisional Do not cite



#### **Report Objectives**

- Construct and populate a comprehensive quality-controlled water temperature dataset for analysis and archive it for future use;
- Evaluate patterns in the relationship between flow and temperature in space and time prior to the Trinity River Record of Decision (ROD);
- Evaluate how ROD flows have affected the thermal regime, temperature compliance, and biological objectives on the Trinity River;
- Evaluate temperature compliance across multiple years (pre-ROD and post-ROD);
- Update conceptual models on stream temperature dynamics in the Trinity River; and
- Develop management recommendations to provide water temperatures in the Trinity River that more efficiently meet objectives of the Trinity River Restoration Program (TRRP).



#### **Report Generalities**

- Approximately:
  - 220 pages overall
  - 180 pages of main body text
  - 40 pages of appendices
- Dozens of reports reviewed spanning decades
- Some datasets spanning over 100 years
- Millions of individual data records analyzed

#### TABLE OF CONTENTS

L	Introduction	14
	<ol> <li>Purpose, need, scope, definitions, and objectives.</li> </ol>	
	1.2 Stream temperature basics	
	1.2.1 Physical drivers of thermal dynamics	
	1.2.2 Temperature effects on stream biota	
	1.3 Overview of the Trinity River Watershed	
	1.4 Trinity River Restoration	
	1.4.1 Temperature objectives	
	1.4.2 Flow management and hypotheses	20
	1.4.2.1 Ascending Limb of snowmelt Peak Flow (April 22 to May 24).	
	1.4.2.2 Descending Limb of Snowmelt Peak (May 5 to July 22)	
	1.4.2.3 Summer/Fall Baseflow (June 26 to October 15)	
,	Data and Methods	14           16           17           20           21           22           23           23           23           23           23           23           23           23           24           25           25           26           27           28           28           30           31           31           31           31           31
	2.1 Available data and reports	23
	2.2 Available temperature models	23
	2.2 Available competatore models	22
	2.2.1 Reserve	
	2.2.2 Ruvel	
	2.5 Analytical methods	
	2.5.1 Statistical	
	2.3.2 Fuling gaps in Lewiston water temperature record	
	Gaps due to gage relocation	
	222 Modeline	
	2.3.3 Modeling	27
	2.3.3.1 Improvements to REMITO model boundary continuous	20
	2.3.3.2 Model predictions annear implausible when Lewiston releases are less than 350 cfs	30
	Characteristic and the second state of the Television and television relations	
,	Stream temperature dynamics of the Trinity River and tributaries	
	3.1 Conceptual model of reservoir / river thermal dynamics.	
	3.2 Unregulated tributaries including upstream of Trinity Reservoir	
	3.3 Reservoir and dam operations	
	3.3.1 Trinity Dam	
	3.3.1.1 Physical characterization of dam, reservoir, and outlet works	
	3.3.1.2 Keservoir temperature dynamics, cold water storage pool, and dam release temperatures	
	3.3.2 Lewiston Dam, diversion, and fish hatchery	
	3.3.2.1 Physical characterization of dam, reservoir, diversions and outlet works, fish hatchery	
	3.3.2.2 Influence of dam operations and water diversions on temperature dynamics	40
	3.3.2.3 Inductore of natchery operations on temperature dynamics	
	3.4 Trinity River now and temperature regime below Lewiston Dam	
	3.4.1 Comparison of natural, unregulated flows to regulated flows with dam operations	
	5.4.1.1 Modering unimparted Lewiston flows	
	2.4.1.2 Summary of effects of dome on Lewiston flows and temperatures	
	3.4.1.5 Summary of effects of dams on Lewiston Hows and temperature 3.4.1.4 Dam and distancian effects on viver temperatures from Lewiston to Weitshoon	
	3.4.2.4 Ambient effects	
	3.4.2.1 Air temperature and solar radiation	
	3.4.2.2 Shading	



#### Methods

- Time separated into four eras
  - Pre-dam era (1911–1961)
  - Full diversion era (1963–1978)
  - Transitional era (1978–1999)
  - ROD era (2000–2019)
- Datasets gathered from
  - USFWS
  - USGS
  - USFS
  - Hoopa Tribe
  - Yurok Tribe
  - Others
- Statistical and modeling
  - RBM10
  - FYFAM, invertebrate lifecycle, salmonid bioenergetics
  - SRH-2D
  - Climate change models
  - Reservoir dynamics
  - Gap filling
  - Linear regression, linear mixed effects models, generalized additive models, and LOESS.





#### Methods

							Beever Cr (8 km2)	- BEAVER_HOBO
				• · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	_	1	Big French Cr (100 km2)	H2O_Temp_Big French Creek
		Source.Entit	y 🕴 🏪 🚃			_	Blue Gr Trap (325 km2)	- 000 - Lower Blue_Trap - BLU 2
		CDEC HSU_FSI		er en state er			Bluff Cr (192 km2)	H2O_Temp_LOCID089     Buff_near/licuth_H2O_temp     Buff_Crock near mouth (RM 0.3)     Buff     edd
		SRNF				-	Browns Cr Mid (147 km2)	- Browns_H2O_temp
		TCPD_W	alercourse				Bull Cr (17 km2)	- BULL_HOBO
		USFS AG	15	-			Cambell Cr Low (18 km2)	+ L_CAMPBELL
	THE REPORT OF THE PARTY OF THE	Klamath Orles USFS N	RIS AqS			A DESCRIPTION OF A DESC	Canyon Cr Low (165 km2)	- CNTR1
	11	USFS of	her				Deadfall Cr (9 km2)	- H2O Temp deadfall1
		USEAS					EE NE Trinks B /100 km2)	H2O_Temp_EFNF Trinity River 1
		Klamath ds Camp	Netrale		-		the rest county is ( rest used)	- EFNFT_H2O_kemp
	1.11.111111	USPR0.					EF Trinity R Upper (198 km2)	+ 051459_temp H2o perm site east fork trim
	100 1 00 1 00	Klamath ds Ullathe		the set of second			EF Trinity R Lower (241 km2)	H2O_Temp_EFTrinity_at_Bridge 103(eft)     East Park
		Klamath de Bois					Grass Valley Cr Low (96 km2)	) + GVT
		Tournam of Doil	_					HorseLinto Jowerbridge H2O_temp
	A DESCRIPTION OF A	Klamath Big Bar					Horse Linto Cr (168 km2)	HUTR1     AUTOCOM NOCI
							Hostler Cr (24 km2)	+L HOSTLER
	TTTTTTTTTTTTTTT	Klamath ds Red (				a province of the local division of the loca	Indian Cr (87 km2)	+ICTR1
							Man or (or ship)	AREMP CAIDN001
Courses Entity	11111111111111						Mill Gr Ldw (125 km2)	+H2O Temp pew1
Source.Entity		Klamath ds Slat				and the second second second	New R Mid (340-342 km2)	- NRbEF_H2O_lamp
HSU_FSP		Manual on Phy						<ul> <li>New River at Trinity River H2O temp</li> <li>New R at mouth</li> </ul>
HVTEPA		WILLIAM DEED THE SAME				Blue Cr B10X (276 km2)	- Blue Cr (B100)	New R at Five Waters - alt     New R at Five Waters
SRNF				1111 111 1		Blue Cr us WF (276 km2)	Blue Cr (upstream of West Ferk)	- H2O_Temp_newbelowdyer
USFS_NRIS_AqS	Source.Er	itity				Blue Cr Low (325 km2)	FBLU_1	2) - H2O_Temp_nftr1
USFWS	5C					Cambell Cr Mid (18 km2)	- CAMPBELL_DIV_HOBO	- NFTR1 - NTR
USFWS_historic	CDEC			-		Common Co Mid (166 hor?)	- CJC	- RCTR1
USGS	HVTE	A		-		canyon crimic (rob kinz)	- 11526300	* ROL
YTEP	USFS	NRIS_AqS		• • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • •		Coffee Cr Low (303 km2)	- CFTR1	* Sandy Bar
YTEP	USFW	8				East Weaver Cr Campground (15 km2)	- EWC_Campground	<ul> <li>SFOCPL H20_temp</li> <li>SFMAD_R20_temp</li> </ul>
	USFW	S_historic				East Weaver Cr Dam (15 km2)	- EWC_Dam	- SPTR1
	USGS				1.00	East Weaver Cr Water Tank (15 km2)	- EWC_Water_Tank	+ STTR1
	YTEP				1000	East Weaver Cr Butterfield Br (31 km2)	- EWC_ButterfieldBrdg	+H2O_Temp_shaart1
	YTEP				1	East Weaver Cr Hwy 3 (31 km2)	- EWC_HWY3king	+L_SUPPLY
						Grass Valley Cr Res Inlet (24 km2)	- GVI	- L_TISHTANG
						Grass Valley Cr Res Outlet (27 km2)	- GVD	- WVC
						Hayfork Creek USGS (982 km2)	- 11528500	<ul> <li>Wilow_MigranfTrsp_nearmouth_H2O_te</li> <li>WilowCreekTemp</li> </ul>
						Little Browns Cr (13 km2)	- Little_Browns_Creek	
				11		Mill Cr Upper (58 km2)	-U_MILL_HOBO	
				100.00.00		Rock Cr (7 km2)	-ROCK_HOBO	
						SF Tish Tang (13 km2)	- SF_TISHTANG_HOBO	
						SF Trinity us Hyampom (889 km2)	+ 11628200	
	1.11					SF Trinity ds Hyamporn (1983 km2)	- 11528700	
	IIII IIII I					SF Trinity nr Salyer (2328 km2)	- 11529000	
				1 1 1 1		Stuart Fk Upper (144 km2)	- StuartForkatBridgeCamp_H2O_Temp	
				111		Supply Creek Upper (26 km2)	- U_SUPPLY_HOBO	
1970 1975 1980 1985	1990 1995 2000 2005 2010			1 1 1 1 1 1		Supply Creek Rock (33 km2)	-SUPPLY_ROCK_HOBO	
	Date					Swift Creek Low (140 km2)	- SWTR1	
						Tish Tang Upper (73 km2)	U_TISHTANG_HCB0	
				11 10 10 110		Captain John Cr (4 km2)	- CAPTAIN_JOHN_HOBO	
				1.0.0.1110		5 Mile Cr (trib to Mill Cr)	- 6_MILE_HOBO	
						Big Pine Cr	FBIG_PINE_HOBO	
						Hospital Cr	-HOSPITAL_HOBO	
				10 1 10		Mill Cr at 5 Mile Cr	MILL_5_MILE_HOBO	
						NF Hoster Cr	PNF_HOSTLER_HOBO	
				1 1 1 1		NF Soctish Cr	-NF_SOCTISH_HOBO	
						NF Supply Cr	-NF_SUPPLY_HOBO	
						NF Tish Tang Cr	NF_TISHTANG_HOBO	
				1111		NF Tish Tang Cr SF Hostler Cr	NF_TISHTANG_HOBO	
						NF Tish Tang Cr SF Hoster Cr SF Soctish Cr	NF_TISHTANG_HOBO SF_HOSTLER_HOBO SF_SOCTISH_HOBO	



#### **Results-Flows**





#### Results – Unimpaired Temperature

Air temperature daily mean (°C)

Water temperature daily mean, min., max. (°C)

Flow daily mean (cfs)

- Need for baseline for comparisons
- Used existing data to develop model for Lewiston water temperature under unimpaired condition
- Generated unimpaired flow and temperature record for all time periods





#### Results-Temperatures

 With dams, water temperatures are warmer in the winter, and colder in the summer





#### Results-Temperature

- Sensitivity analysis for discharge during critical rearing period
- Release temperature is warmer than unimpaired temperatures at Lewiston from February thru April and colder starting in May
- Relative impacts to stream temperature from discharge are much greater starting in May of Dry and Critically Dry years and June of Normal and wetter years





Results-Biological Metrics

> Colder temperatures reduce salmonid growth rate, increase invertebrate generation time, and increase frog metamorphisis time



#### **Results-Salmonid Growth**



Restoration of the second



#### **Results-**Salmonid Growth

•

300 cfs

500 cfs

1000 cfs

1500 cfs

2000 cfs

3000 cfs

4000 cfs • × • Historic

- Greater flows in the winter months and lower flows in the spring result in greater salmonid growth
- In part a function of • flows and stratification from **Trinity Reservoir**



#### Results – Temperature compliance

- Records by which to assess compliance are limited
- It is not clear that compliance has been increased by ROD flows



#### Results-Ceremonial and Adult Salmonid Fall Flow Releases





#### Results-Ceremonial and Adult Salmonid Fall Flow Releases



## Results – lateral thermal diversity

- Channel form can influence local thermal diversity
- The impaired channel offers little choice for mobile ectothermic organisms
- Topographically influenced thermal diversity could be substantial at channel rehab sites



#### **Results-Trinity Reservoir**





#### **Results-Trinity Reservoir**



#### **Results-Trinity Reservoir**

![](_page_21_Figure_1.jpeg)

![](_page_21_Picture_2.jpeg)

#### **Results-Climate Change**

![](_page_22_Figure_1.jpeg)

Under a high-emissions scenario, average snow water equivalent in areas above 3,000 ft elevation is predicted to decline from 11.6 inches in 1981-2010 to 4.3 inches in 2040-2069 and 1.6 inches in 2070-2099 (Micheli et al. 2018).

![](_page_22_Picture_3.jpeg)

#### **Results-Climate Change**

![](_page_23_Figure_1.jpeg)

For the Salmon River watershed (Asarian et al. 2019) predicted that in the 2070–2099 period, mean daily maximum August stream temperatures will be warmer than the 1990– 2017 baseline by 0.9– 2.0°C under the reducedemission RCP4.5 scenario or 1.7–3.3°C under the high-emission RCP8.5 scenario

![](_page_23_Picture_3.jpeg)

#### **Major Findings**

- ROD flows have reduced spring temperatures to be less than pre-dam and pre-ROD scenarios, affecting biological processes
- Flows and temperatures from Lewiston Dam cannot be manipulated separately in an effective manner (aside from reservoir storage and diversion rate)
  - Forces spring ROD flows to be colder than optimal rearing temperatures for salmonids
  - Increases production time for important invertebrate food sources for salmonids
  - Coldwater pool cannot be maximized
- Trinity Reservoir temperatures appear to be warming
- Meeting temperature objectives in the fall for returning adult salmonids and eggs will become more challenging in the future, without infrastructure changes

![](_page_24_Picture_8.jpeg)

#### Recommendations

- 1. Monitor temperatures in the Trinity River upstream of Trinity Lake to more fully understand the natural temperature regime and its effects on water temperatures in Trinity Reservoir.
- 2. Until a TCD can be installed in Trinity Reservoir and/or other infrastructure changes, flows in spring months should recede beginning in April of Dry and Critically Dry and in May of Normal and wetter years for optimal juvenile salmonid growth (13-18 °C).
- 3. Reduce emphasis on meeting ROD temperature targets for smoltification at Weitchpec. Instead, balance between growth, encouraging timely outmigration, and mitigating temperatures in the lower river as they approach the thermal limits of juvenile salmonids.
- 4. Infrastructure of the TRD should be modified to enable flow and temperature management actions to be implemented for the benefit of the river ecosystem, including:
  - a. Installation of a multi-level temperature control device in Trinity Reservoir;
  - b. Removal of Lewiston Dam, or a new type of conveyance through or around Lewiston; and
  - c. Ability to vary dam releases to the river at two-hour intervals without negatively impacting infrastructure at Lewiston Dam.

![](_page_25_Picture_8.jpeg)

#### **Recommendations continued**

- 5. End of September storage minimum of 0.75 million acre-feet (MAF) should be adhered to following the recommendations of Bender (2012), and multi-year drought contingency planning that specifies steps taken when reservoir storage is predicted to be less than 1.25 MAF in any year, assuming a multi-year drought is possible at any time.
- 6. An assessment of multiyear drought effects on Trinity Reservoir storage levels, water temperatures, and the resulting ability to meet temperature criteria in the Trinity River should be conducted.
- 7. Development of a tool for accurately predicting Trinity River water temperatures in summer at flows lower than RBM10's current limit of approximately 350 cfs.

![](_page_26_Picture_4.jpeg)

### Words of Caution

- What we're not saying:
  - Lewiston Dam releases are always too cold
  - Less water is needed to be released from the Trinity River to TRD
- What we are saying:
  - In the spring, Lewiston Dam releases are colder than the optimal growth temperatures for rearing juvenile salmonids
  - Management options are currently limited by the fact that flow and temperature cannot be managed separately
  - A more nuanced approach to temperature and flow management is needed to maximize juvenile salmonid growth in the spring, and to protect adult salmonids and their eggs in the late summer and fall

#### Thank you!

- USFWS
- USGS
- USFS
- Hoopa Tribe
- Yurok Tribe
- Reclamation
- Other collaborators

![](_page_28_Picture_8.jpeg)

![](_page_28_Picture_9.jpeg)